

TODD KIM, Assistant Attorney General  
 SETH M. BARSKY, Section Chief  
 MEREDITH L. FLAX, Assistant Section Chief  
 MICHAEL R. EITEL, Senior Trial Attorney  
 ASTRID STUTH CEVALLOS, Trial Attorney  
 U.S. Department of Justice  
 Environment & Natural Resources Division  
 Wildlife & Marine Resources Section  
 999 18<sup>th</sup> Street, South Terrace 370  
 Denver, Colorado 80202  
 Phone: (303) 844-1479 (Eitel)  
 (202) 305-5751 (Cevallos)  
 Fax: (303) 844-1375 (Eitel)  
 (202) 305-0275 (Cevallos)  
 Email: Michael.Eitel@usdoj.gov  
 Astrid.Cevallos@usdoj.gov

*Attorneys for Federal Defendants*

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

DEFENDERS OF WILDLIFE, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

U.S. FISH AND WILDLIFE SERVICE, et al.,

Federal Defendants.

Case No. 4:21-cv-00344-JSW

**ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION TO  
 CONSIDER WHETHER CASES  
 SHOULD BE RELATED**

This case and two other pending lawsuits—*WildEarth Guardians v. Haaland*, 4:21-cv-349-JSW, and *Natural Resources Defense Council v. U.S. Department of the Interior*, 4:21-cv-561-JSW—challenge the U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service’s 2020 Rule delisting gray wolves. The Court related the three cases (ECF 17), resolved cross-motions for summary judgment (ECF 138), and entered Judgment in Plaintiffs’ favor (ECF 139). Because the time for appeal has not lapsed, a final judgment has not yet issued in the three related cases.

Under Civil L.R. 3-12 and 7-11, Federal Defendants provide the Court with notice of a fourth case recently transferred to this District that is related to these three existing lawsuits—

1 *Aland* v. *U.S. Department of the Interior*, 3:22-cv-1321-JCS. Under Civil L.R. 3-12(d)(2), the  
 2 “brief statement of the relationship of the actions according to the [two] criteria set forth in Civil  
 3 L.R. 3-12(a)” is as follows:

4 1. Civil Local Rule 3-12(a)(1) provides that an action is related to another action  
 5 when the actions “concern substantially the same parties, property, transaction or event.” Here,  
 6 the three existing related cases and *Aland*, 3:22-cv-1321, challenge the same final rule  
 7 promulgated by the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (“Service”) that removes gray wolves from  
 8 the Endangered Species Act’s (“ESA”) list of endangered and threatened wildlife (Final Rule, 85  
 9 Fed. Reg. 69,778 (Nov. 3, 2020)). *See Defs. of Wildlife*, 4:21-cv-344, ECF 1 ¶ 1; *WildEarth*  
 10 *Guardians*, 4:21-cv-349, ECF 1 ¶ 2; *Nat. Res. Def. Council*, 4:21-cv-561, ECF 1 ¶ 1; *Aland*,  
 11 3:22-cv-1321, ECF 1 ¶ 1. While the specific claims in *Aland* differ from those pled in the three  
 12 related cases, all four actions involve the same Federal Defendants (U.S. Fish and Wildlife  
 13 Service, Secretary of the Department of the Interior), the same subject matter (gray wolves), and  
 14 the same “transaction or event” (the Service’s final 2020 regulation).

15 2. Civil L.R. 3-12(a)(2) also provides that a case is related when judicial review of  
 16 different actions before different judges would result in an “unduly burdensome duplication of  
 17 labor and expense” or risk “conflicting results.” *Aland* raises claims that are reviewed on the  
 18 same administrative record that governed the Court’s review of the claims in the three related  
 19 cases. *See, e.g., Aland*, 3:22-cv-1321, ECF 1 ¶ 10. Given the Court’s familiarity with the Final  
 20 Rule and the advanced stage of proceedings in the three related cases, assigning *Aland* to this  
 21 Court will promote judicial efficiency.

22 For the reasons set forth above, the three existing related cases are also related to *Aland*,  
 23 3:22-cv-1321, within the meaning of Civil Local Rule 3-12(a).

24 DATED: March 9, 2022.

25  
 26 TODD KIM, Assistant Attorney General  
 27 SETH M. BARSKY, Section Chief  
 28 MEREDITH L. FLAX, Assistant Section Chief

/s/ Michael R. Eitel

MICHAEL R. EITEL, Senior Trial Attorney

/s/ Astrid Stuth Cevallos

ASTRID STUTH CEVALLOS, Trial Attorney

U.S. Department of Justice

Environment & Natural Resources Division

Wildlife & Marine Resources Section

999 18<sup>th</sup> Street, South Terrace 370

Denver, Colorado 80202

Phone: (303) 844-1479 (Eitel)

(202) 305-5751 (Cevallos)

Fax: (303) 844-1375 (Eitel)

(202) 305-0275 (Cevallos)

Email: Michael.Eitel@usdoj.gov

Astrid.Cevallos@usdoj.gov

*Attorneys for Federal Defendants*

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

DEFENDERS OF WILDLIFE, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

U.S. FISH AND WILDLIFE SERVICE, et al.,

Federal Defendants.

Case No. 4:21-cv-00344-JSW

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

WILDEARTH GUARDIANS, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

DEBRA HAALAND, et al.,

Federal Defendants.

Case No. 4:21-cv-00349-JSW

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

NATURAL RESOURCES DEFENSE COUNCIL,  
et al.,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR, et al.,

Federal Defendants.

Case No. 4:21-cv-00561-JSW

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

ROBERT H. ALAND,

Plaintiff,

vs.

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR, et al.,

Federal Defendants.

Case No. 3:22-cv-01321-JCS

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of such to the attorneys of record. I also certify that I caused to be sent, via electronic mail, the foregoing to the following counsel of record:

Robert H. Aland  
140 Old Green Bay Road  
Winnetka, IL 60093  
Phone: (847) 784-0994  
Email: rhaland@comcast.net

Francis William Sturges, Jr.  
Natural Resources Defense Council  
20 N. Wacker Drive, Suite 1600  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Phone: (312) 847-6807  
Email: fsturges@nrdc.org

John R. Mellgren  
Western Environmental Law Center  
120 Shelton McMurphey Blvd., Ste.  
340  
Eugene, OR 97401  
Phone: (541) 359-0990  
Email: mellgren@westernlaw.org

Andrew Adams  
Hogen Adams PLLC  
1935 County Rd. B2 W, Suite 460  
St. Paul, MN 55113  
Phone: (651) 842-9100  
Email: Aadams@hogenadams.com

Kelly Elizabeth Nokes  
Western Environmental Law Center  
P.O. Box 218  
Buena Vista, CO 81211  
Phone: (575) 613-0851  
Email: nokes@westernlaw.org

Deborah Ann Sivas  
Environmental Law Clinic  
Mills Legal Clinic at Stanford Law  
School  
Crown Quadrangle 559  
Nathan Abbott Way  
Stanford, CA 94305  
Phone: (650) 723-0325  
Email: Dsivas@stanford.edu

Jason Robert Flanders  
Aqua Terra Aeris Law Group  
4030 Martin Luther King Jr. Way  
Oakland, CA 94609  
Phone: (916) 202-3018  
Email: jrf@atalawgroup.com

Karma Barsam Brown  
Hunton Andrews Kurth LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, DC 20037  
Phone: (202) 955-1893  
Email: Kbbrown@huntonak.com

Jared Eldridge Knicley  
Natural Resources Defense Council  
1152 15th St. NW, Suite 300  
Washington, DC 20005  
Phone: (202) 513-6242  
Email: jknicley@nrdc.org

Marguerite Clare Ellis  
Hunton Andrews Kurth LLP  
50 California Street, Suite 1700  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Phone: (415) 975-3708  
Email: Cellis@huntonak.com

Katherine K. Desormeau  
Natural Resources Defense Council  
111 Sutter St., 21st Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94104  
Phone: (415) 875-6158  
Email: kdesormeau@nrdc.org

Stanford H. Atwood, Jr.  
Atwood & Associates  
750 University Avenue, Suite 130

1	Los Gatos, CA 95032	Angela Hoffman Shaw
2	Phone: (408) 935-5503	Berliner Cohen
3	Email: Stanford@atwoodlaw.net	10 Almaden Blvd., Suite 1100
4		San Jose, CA 95113
5	Hadan W. Hatch	Phone: (408) 286-5800
6	National Rifle Association	Email: Angela.Shaw@berliner.com
7	Office of Litigation Counsel	
8	11250 Waples Mill Road	George Richard Pitts
9	Fairfax, VA 22030	Rubin and Rudman, LLP
10	Phone: (703) 267-1161	800 Connecticut Avenue, NW, Suite
11	Email: Hhatch@nrahq.org	400
12		Washington, DC
13	Michael T. Jean	Phone: (240) 356-1566
14	NRA – ILA	Email: Gpitts@bhb.com
15	11250 Waples Mill Road	
16	Fairfax, VA 22030	Jason DeForest
17	Phone: (703) 267-1158	Utah Attorney General's Office
18	Email: Mjean@nrahq.org	350 North State Street, Suite 5110
19		Salt Lake City, UT 84114
20	Jeremy Evan Clare	Phone: (385) 395-9884
21	Safari Club International	Email: Jdeforest@agutah.gov
22	501 2nd St NE	
23	Washington, DC 20002	Kelsie Lynn Last
24	Phone: (202) 609-8179	Utah Attorney General's Office
25	Email: Jclare@safariclub.org	350 North State Street, Suite 5110
26		Salt Lake City, UT 84114
27	Regina Lennox	Phone: (801) 537-9814
28	Safari Club International	Email: Klast@agutah.gov
	501 2nd St NE	
	Washington, DC 20002	Jeffrey Rasmussen
	Phone: (202) 309-7862	Patterson Earnhart Real Bird Wilson
	Email: Rlennox@safariclub.org	LLP
		1900 Plaza Drive
	James Hardwick Lister	Louisville, CO 80027
	Birch Horton Bittner and Cherot	Phone: (303) 926-5292
	1100 Connecticut Avenue, NW,	Email:
	Suite 825	Jrasmussen@nativelawgroup.com
	Washington, DC 20036	
	Phone: (202) 659-5800	Jeremy Joseph Patterson
	Email: Jlistner@bhb.com	Patterson Earnhart Real Bird Wilson
		LLP
	Jonathan David Wolf	1900 Plaza Drive
	Berliner Cohen	Louisville, CO 80027
	10 Almaden Blvd., Suite 1100	Phone: (303) 926-5292
	San Jose, CA 95113	Email:
	Phone: (408) 286-5800	Jpatterson@nativelawgroup.com
	Email: Jonathan.Wolf@berliner.com	

1 Paul Pickering Spaulding, III  
2 Shartsis Friese LLP  
3 One Maritime Plaza, 18th Floor  
4 San Francisco, CA 94111  
5 Phone: (415) 421-6500  
6 Email: Sspaulding@sflaw.com

Lane Ruhland  
Ruhland Law and Strategy, LLC  
215 S Century Avenue #198  
Waunakee, WI 53597  
Phone: (608) 434-1497  
Email: Lane@ruhlandlaw.com

5 Sanjeet Sham Ganjam  
6 Shartsis Friese LLP  
7 One Maritime Plaza, 18th Floor  
8 San Francisco, CA 94111  
9 Phone: (415) 421-6500  
10 Email: Sganjam@sflaw.com

George M. Lee  
Seiler Epstein LLP  
275 Battery Street, Suite 1600  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Phone: (415) 979-0500  
Email: Gml@seilerepstein.com

9 Suzanne Spaulding Orza  
10 Shartsis Friese LLP  
11 One Maritime Plaza, 18th Floor  
12 San Francisco, CA 94111  
13 Phone: (415) 421-6500  
14 Email: Sorza@sflaw.com

14 /s/ Astrid Stuth Cevallos  
15 ASTRID STUTH CEVALLOS  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28